



CLASS: 602-04/24-02/130

FILE NUMBER: 355-01-01-24-01

Zagreb, 13 June 2024

Pursuant to provisions of Article 8, Paragraph 3 of the Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Science (the Official Gazette 151/22) and provisions of Article 32, Paragraph 1, Items 1 and 2 of the Statute of the Agency for Science and Higher Education (CLASS: 003-05/13-01/0001; FILE NUMBER: 355-01-23-29) and the Decision on amendments to the Statute of the Agency for Science and Higher Education (CLASS: 003-05/13-01/0001; FILE NUMBER: 355-01-02-24-36) at its 14th regular session held on 13 June 2024, the Accreditation Council adopted the following

QUALITY STANDARDS FOR EVALUATIONS IN THE INITIAL ACCREDITATION OF ONLINE DOCTORAL STUDIES

Article 1

- (1) Quality standards for evaluations in the initial accreditation of online doctoral studies (hereinafter: Quality Standards) shall apply to study programmes which are fully delivered by means of computer technologies and interactive teaching materials, thereby permitting access to learning in specific conditions when teacher and student are physically distant (hereinafter: online studies).
- (2) Quality Standards include standards, elements and quality indicators and criteria for the initial accreditation of online doctoral studies, against which the level of their fulfilment is determined and a quality assessment is passed.
- (3) Quality Standards are grouped into units (four assessment areas) content-wise, and they refer to various aspects of quality assessment of online doctoral studies.
- (4) For the purposes of this document, the following expressions shall have the following meanings:
- *Standard* is a clearly defined level of quality of a particular aspect of quality of a higher education institution.
 - *Element of the standard* is taken into account when assessing compliance of an aspect of quality of a higher education institution and a study programme against a standard.



- The *criterion for the initial accreditation of the study programme* is related to Article 12 of the Quality Assurance Act (151/22), which must be complied with during the initial accreditation of a higher education institution/study programme, and it is highlighted red in the text.
- *Indicators* are used to assess the level of compliance with the standards.
- *Sources for verifying compliance with the standards* are documents of the higher education institution, websites and other materials that serve to check and assess the level of fulfilment of the standards. The sources listed in this document are merely examples that a higher education institution can use as guidelines in the preparation of the proposal of the online doctoral study programme, as well as aid to the expert panel in assessing the level of fulfilment of Quality Standards. Both the higher education institution and the expert panel can use other sources and information available in the application form and collected during the site visit to the higher education institution.
- *The level of fulfilment of the standards* is a quantitative and a qualitative grade passed by an expert panel which includes recommendations for quality improvement.

(5) Gendered terms used in this document are used neutrally and refer equally to all genders.



Article 2

In the initial accreditation of the online doctoral study programme, the following quality standards shall apply:

I. Internal quality assurance

1.1. Planning and proposing of the online doctoral study programme is based on the long-term strategy of scientific research in the scientific field in which the online doctoral study programme will be delivered and the higher education institution development plan. It is connected to the national development and the labour market, and various stakeholders, including students, were involved in its development.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>Planning and proposing the online doctoral study programme is in line with the mission and strategic goals of the higher education institution.</p> <p>Planning and proposing of the online doctoral study programme is in line with the strategy of scientific research of the higher education institution.</p> <p>Planning and proposing of the online doctoral study programme contributes to the national development of higher education and science.</p> <p>Planning and proposing of the online doctoral study programme is aligned with the National Development Strategy of the Republic of Croatia for the period until 2030.</p> <p>In the course of planning and proposing the online doctoral study programme, the following was taken into account: e-learning is part of the HEI's e-learning strategy or is part of a special strategy to digitally innovate / transform the HEI, in addition to which the strategy includes an explanation why e-learning was chosen as an appropriate learning strategy (e.g., adapting to current societal needs, greater availability of the programme, competitive academic environment, joint programmes, mobility and the like).</p> <p>In the course of planning and proposing the new online doctoral study programme, the higher education institution made sure that the online doctoral study programme was specific and did not overlap with similar programmes in the Republic of Croatia.</p>			



The online doctoral study programme was approved by a competent expert body (for example, senate, faculty or academy council).

Labour market analysis has been taken into account in the course of proposing the online doctoral study programme.

Various stakeholders, including doctoral candidates, were involved in the process of planning and proposing of the online doctoral study programme, where applicable.

Minimal institutional requirements of the proposed online doctoral study programme are comparable to similar accredited programmes in the Republic of Croatia and EU member states.

In the course of proposing the online doctoral study programme, the Croatian Employment Service submitted an opinion on the compatibility of the programme with the labour market needs, i.e. evidence that an application to issue an opinion on this matter was submitted to the Croatian Employment Service at least 30 days prior.

The higher education institution was not issued a letter of expectation for performing higher education activity at the moment of submitting the application.

Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:

- Long-term strategy of scientific research for the scientific area in which the online doctoral study programme is delivered;
- Proposal of the online doctoral study programme;
- Rules and procedures for the adoption of new online doctoral programme / changes to the delivery mode of existing doctoral study programme;
- Analysis of the compatibility of the online doctoral study programme with the strategic goals of the higher education institution;
- Online doctoral programme justification;
- Decision of the expert body (faculty council, university senate) on adopting the online doctoral study programme proposal;
- Analysis of minimum institutional requirements for comparability of the proposed online doctoral programme with similar accredited doctoral study programmes in the Republic of Croatia and EU member states;
- Feasibility study justifying the need for a new online doctoral study programme in the case of public higher education institutions;
- Analysis of alignment of the doctoral studies with the National Development Strategy of the Republic of Croatia;
- Decision to appoint a working group for planning and proposing the online doctoral study programme;
- Conclusions, minutes of the meetings and similar documents on the involvement of stakeholders in the procedure of proposing of the online doctoral study programme;
- Examples of involving various stakeholders in the planning and proposing of the online doctoral study programme;
- Opinion of the Croatian Employment Service on the compatibility of the study programme with the labour market, i.e. evidence that an application to issue an opinion on this matter



agency for science and higher education croatia

was submitted to the Croatian Employment Service at least 30 days prior.



1.2. The higher education institution has developed the procedure of monitoring online doctoral study programme performance and its further development, including the analysis of the current situation and the use of feedback obtained from various stakeholders for the study programme enhancement.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The management and continuous enhancement of the online doctoral programme is aligned with the quality assurance policy of the higher education institution.</p> <p>The higher education institution has established the internal quality assurance and enhancement system.</p> <p>The higher education institution has developed the procedure and mechanisms for monitoring the online doctoral study programme performance and identified key performance indicators.</p> <p>Mechanisms for regularly monitoring teachers' and supervisors' performance have been planned;</p> <p>Mechanisms for regularly evaluating e-course delivery have been planned.</p> <p>The higher education institution is planning to perform the analysis of the current situation for the purpose of development of the online doctoral study programme.</p> <p>The higher education institution has developed mechanisms for using feedback obtained from various stakeholders for the enhancement of the online doctoral study programme.</p> <p>The higher education institution has set up electronic records and data collections, and separate records on the success of evaluation of achieved learning outcomes and processes personal and other information gathered for the purpose of carrying out teaching activity.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Publicly available quality assurance policy;• Processes and data which will be used to monitor various aspects of the online doctoral study programme;			



- Key indicators which will be used to monitor online doctoral programme quality and data collection methods;
- Plan for assuring online doctoral programme quality, including target values for key indicators and deadlines;
- Rules, procedures and activities used to adopt and assure online doctoral study programme quality and continuous enhancement;
- Procedures used to enhance the online doctoral study programme;
- Student surveys and other mechanisms for gathering feedback on the online doctoral study programme performance;
- Records and data collections.



1.3. Admission quotas are determined based on teaching and supervision capacities, scientific and societal needs and in accordance with the analysis of the labour market needs.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>Admission quotas are based on teaching and supervision capacities of the higher education institution. Admission quotas are based on the national scientific and societal needs. The higher education institution aligned admission quotas with the labour market needs. Admission quotas published on the website are clear and updated. The higher education institution publishes information on admissions to the online doctoral study programme, international mobility requirements, student obligations and recognition of prior learning.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Employment contracts for staff on scientific-teaching positions;• Analysis of the alignment of admission quotas with societal needs;• Opinion of the Croatian Employment Service on the compatibility of the programme with the labour market, i.e. evidence that an application to issue an opinion was submitted to the Croatian Employment Service at least 30 days prior;• Number of research projects (in cooperation with the business sector, higher education institutions and institutes) of potential supervisors as a basis for part of the quota of prospective doctoral candidates.			



1.4. The higher education institution has developed a clear plan for good international networking and mobility of teachers and doctoral candidates.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The online doctoral study programme ensures doctoral candidates' mobility in the national and European Higher Education Area.</p> <p>The online doctoral study programme fosters international networking and mobility of teachers and supervisors.</p> <p>The doctoral study programme fosters international networking and mobility of doctoral candidates.</p> <p>The doctoral study programme encourages the participation of teachers, supervisors and doctoral students in international projects.</p> <p>The online doctoral study programme encourages the publication of research papers in the internationally renowned publications.</p> <p>The online doctoral study programme ensures a mechanism for attracting international academic experts and doctoral candidates.</p> <p>Doctoral dissertation can be written in the English language.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• HEI's international cooperation agreements;• Involvement of teachers/supervisors in international research projects;• Mechanisms for encouraging doctoral candidates to publish papers in the internationally recognized outlets;• Mechanisms for encouraging teachers/supervisors and doctoral candidates to actively participate in international conferences and symposia;• Study programme, regulations.			



1.5. The rights and obligations of doctoral candidates are regulated by relevant acts of the higher education institution and the study contract which provides institutional and supervisor support to doctoral candidates.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The rights and obligations of doctoral candidates are regulated by relevant acts of the higher education institution.</p> <p>The rights and obligations of doctoral candidates are regulated by the relevant study contract which provides supervisory and institutional support.</p> <p>The rights and obligations of doctoral candidates are clear and updated, and published on the website of the higher education institution, and are easily accessible.</p> <p>The higher education institution regularly publishes updated information about the requirements for admissions to the doctoral online studies and enrolment in the following study year.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Acts regulating the rights and obligations of doctoral candidates;• Plan and program of the doctoral study programme;• Study contracts.			



1.6. The higher education institution pursues a strong policy of research integrity, ethics and professional conduct.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The higher education institution has planned activities as part of the online doctoral study programme aimed at strengthening the research integrity, especially activities designed to raise awareness, prevent and detect breaches of research integrity and acting upon them.</p> <p>The higher education institution has planned monitoring of the quality of internal mechanisms related to academic integrity in all scientific disciplines and activities, including research, innovations, expertise, support, etc.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Code of Ethics of the higher education institution;• Ethics Committee;• Activities connected to raising awareness on research integrity, ethics and professional conduct (workshops, lectures, courses, educational material, etc.);• Internal mechanisms connected to academic integrity;• Documents regulating procedures in the event of unethical and unprofessional behaviour;• Anti-plagiarism software;• Examples of the sanctioning of unethical behaviour, if any.			



II. Study programme

2.1. The content and quality of the online doctoral programme are aligned with the latest scientific achievements in the relevant discipline, professional standards and internationally recognized standards of quality of doctoral education.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The content and quality of the online doctoral study programme are aligned with level 8.2. of the Croatian Qualifications Framework The proposed online doctoral study programme is compatible with the qualification standard added in the Croatian Qualifications Framework Register. The online doctoral study programme lasts at least three years and leads to the acquisition of 180 ECTS credits (including the research component). The content of the online doctoral study programme is in keeping with the latest scientific findings and skills resulting from them. The content of the online doctoral study programme is aligned with professional standards and recent achievements in the respective field. The content of the online doctoral study programme is in keeping with the latest trends and best practices of similar international study programmes. The higher education institution encourages creativity in the online doctoral studies design. The higher education institution provides evidence of the alignment of the content of each online course with the intended course outcomes, where applicable.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Plan and program of the online doctoral study programme;• Comparative analysis of the online doctoral study programme with similar accredited doctoral study programmes in the Republic of Croatia and the European Union.			



2.2. The higher education institution has a document on accredited graduate i.e. integrated undergraduate and graduate studies delivered in the same scientific or artistic field and the name of the online doctoral study programme is aligned with the content of the online doctoral study programme and the qualification gained upon completion of the studies.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The higher education institution has accredited study programmes leading up to the doctoral study in the same scientific field.</p> <p>The name of the study programme is aligned with the content of the doctoral study programme and the qualification obtained upon completion of the study programme.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The document on the accredited undergraduate and graduate i.e. integrated study programme delivered in the same research/artistic fields in which the online doctoral study programme is proposed;• Study programme proposal which, among other, comprises the name of the study programme, the scientific area and field in which the study programme is proposed, and the academic degree obtained upon completion of the study programme.			



2.3. Intended learning outcomes of the online doctoral study programme are aligned with level 8.2. of the Croatian Qualifications Framework and are clearly linked to the learning outcomes of individual teaching content, supervisors' and research work.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The intended learning outcomes must be achievable in an online environment.</p> <p>The intended learning outcomes of the doctoral online study programme have been clearly defined, and examples of good practice have been used for this purpose.</p> <p>The intended online doctoral programme outcomes clearly reflect the competences required to participate in the labour market, continue one's education or meet other needs of individuals, society or scientific discipline.</p> <p>The intended online doctoral programme outcomes are comparable with the intended outcomes of comparable programmes in the Republic of Croatia and EU member states.</p> <p>The intended online doctoral programme outcomes have been formulated so as to allow students to acquire digital skills (21st century skills) which include oral, multicultural and other communication skills, critical and analytical thinking skills, information literacy, leadership skills, collaboration, teamwork and the like.</p> <p>The intended learning outcomes and competences acquired on the online doctoral study programme may be no different from outcomes and competences acquired on a study programme with different modes of delivery.</p> <p>The intended learning outcomes of the doctoral study programme also include the development of generic and profession-specific competences.</p> <p>The higher education institution proves the alignment of the intended learning outcomes with the mission and strategic documents of the higher education institution.</p> <p>The higher education institution clearly defined intended learning outcomes of all content in the online doctoral study programme.</p>			



The intended learning outcomes of each element of the online doctoral study programme are aligned with its mode of delivery.

Intended learning outcomes at the level of the online doctoral study programme are aligned with the competences a student should gain by completing the study programme.

Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:

- Plan and program of the online doctoral study programme;
- The intended learning outcomes at the online doctoral study programme;
- Alignment of study-level learning outcomes with level 8.2. of the Croatian Qualifications Framework;
- Mission and strategic goals of the higher education institution;
- Learning outcomes of particular teaching content leading to the achievement of the learning outcomes at the level of the online doctoral study programme;
- Employer/HEI survey regarding competences required on the labour market.



2.4. Teaching and learning methods are suitable for level 8.2. of the Croatian Qualifications Framework and ensure the achievement of clearly defined intended learning outcomes.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>Learning and teaching methods are in line with level 8.2. of the Croatian Qualifications Framework.</p> <p>Learning and teaching methods ensure the fulfilment of clearly defined learning outcomes.</p> <p>The online doctoral study programme is oriented to research and independent study of the doctoral candidates.</p> <p>The planned teaching methods encourage student-centred learning: interactive and research-based learning, problem solving, creative and critical thinking, as well as autonomy and responsibility through individual and group projects, cooperative learning, problem-based learning, field work and other interactive methods.</p> <p>Classes may be followed synchronously and asynchronously, where applicable.</p> <p>Flexibility is ensured with regard to time, place and course of studying.</p> <p>Access has been provided to digital literature (if any) in the e-course, while copyright protection is ensured.</p> <p>Communication between students and between students and teachers is ensured (asynchronous and synchronous) via forum, chat, videoconferencing tools, email or other means.</p> <p>Planned modes of instruction are adapted to a diverse student population.</p> <p>Mechanisms for the assessment and adjustment of the used modes of programme delivery and teaching methods used have been ensured.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Programme of the doctoral online study programme;• Description of individual courses (introductory methodology courses and research, and independent research conducted by the doctoral candidate);			



agency for science and higher education croatia

- Mechanisms for quality assurance of teaching delivery;
- Learning Analytics.



2.5. The content of the online doctoral study programme is adapted to the needs of research activity and training doctoral candidates for pursuing research activity (individual course plan, generic skills, etc.).	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The content of the online doctoral study programme is adapted to the needs of research activity and training doctoral candidates for pursuing research activity.</p> <p>Content of the online doctoral study programme is adapted to level 8.2. of the Croatian Qualifications Framework.</p> <p>The online doctoral study programme anticipates the acquisition of generic competences, including digital competences.</p> <p>The higher education institution plans to involve doctoral candidates in the research project implementation.</p> <p>The higher education institution makes provision for the recognition and evaluation of the research activity performed by doctoral candidates in the course of studies.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Plan and program of the doctoral online study programme;• Intended mechanisms for involving doctoral candidates in the research projects implementation;• Intended mechanisms for recognizing and assessing research activity performed by doctoral candidates over the course of study.			



III. Teaching process and doctoral candidates support

3.1. Admission procedure is coherent and transparent, the criteria are aligned with international standards, the complaints procedure is in place and the admission procedure is based on the selection of the best i.e. motivated and talented doctoral candidates.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>Requirements for admission to or continuation of online doctoral studies, admission criteria and procedure, and requirements for the completion of online doctoral studies and issuing qualifications are clearly defined, published in time and publicly available.</p> <p>The planned criteria for admission to or continuation of online doctoral studies ensure the selection of candidates with appropriate prior knowledge, which is aligned with the requirements of the online doctoral study programme.</p> <p>Admission criteria are aligned with international standards.</p> <p>The complaints procedure is in place as part of the selection procedure.</p> <p>The selection procedure leads to the admission of the best doctoral candidates.</p> <p>Detailed information has been provided on the requirements students must meet in order to join the online doctoral study programme, which includes the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Necessary computer equipment and bandwidth speed in accordance with the requirements of online doctoral studies;- Prior knowledge required to attend the chosen online doctoral study programme (e.g. knowledge of specific digital tools or additional knowledge and skills, such as language proficiency and the like);- Operative knowledge of computer equipment and specific software use for the chosen online doctoral study programme. <p>Students may enrol in the doctoral study programme online: documentation may be submitted in accordance with a predefined procedure used to verify</p>			



the authenticity of original documents, tuition fees may be paid and other administrative issues may be regulated online.

Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:

- Regulations on the doctoral study programme;
- Criteria for admission in the doctoral study programme;
- Defined decision-making procedure in relation to the admission criteria;
- Defined procedures for recognizing Croatian and foreign higher education qualifications, periods of study and prior learning;
- Alignment of admission criteria with the level 8.2. of the Croatian Qualifications Framework.



3.2. The higher education institution ensures the recognition of prior achievements of applicants and provides equal admission opportunities for all applicants.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The criteria for admission or continuation of studies are clearly defined. The higher education institution has defined procedures for the recognition of prior learning. The higher education institution has defined procedures for the recognition of prior achievements. Mechanisms are in place which will enable equal admission opportunities for all doctoral candidates (including underrepresented groups). Support has been ensured for users with specific requirements (content and activities have been prepared in alternate form). Flexibility is ensured with regard to time, place and course of studying.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Admission criteria;• Regulations governing admissions and progression of candidates in the online doctoral study programme;• Regulations governing the recognition of prior achievements of applicants;• Procedures of recognition of foreign higher education qualifications.			



3.3. Conditions for the study programme progression and completion, as well as the process of developing and defending the doctoral thesis are clear and transparent, and include a public presentation of the doctoral thesis proposal, and a public defence and publication of the doctoral thesis, as well as an independent committee for the thesis proposal and thesis assessment.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The procedure of developing and defending the doctoral thesis is clear and transparent.</p> <p>There is a public presentation of the doctoral thesis proposal.</p> <p>There is a public defence of the doctoral thesis at the higher education institution.</p> <p>There is a committee for the defence and assessment of the doctoral thesis proposal and doctoral thesis, of which the thesis supervisor is not a member.</p> <p>There is a committee for the defence and assessment of the doctoral thesis proposal and the assessment of the doctoral thesis in which at least one member is from an external institution.</p> <p>The doctoral thesis will be publicly available 30 days prior to the defence.</p> <p>The doctoral thesis will be published in the repository of the higher education institution at least 30 days from the day of defence of the doctoral thesis.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Regulations governing the doctoral thesis proposal submission, doctoral thesis defence and assessment;• Plan and program of the doctoral online study programme;• The number of doctoral theses from other doctoral studies of the higher education institution available in open access in the institutional repository of the higher education institution (in the previous five years);• The share of doctoral dissertations available in open access through the institutional repository of the higher education institution in the total number of doctoral dissertations defended at the higher education institution in that period (in the last five years);• The number of open-access final and graduation theses of the higher education institution available in the institutional repository of the higher education institution (in the previous five years);• The share of open-access final and graduation theses of the higher education institution available in the institutional repository of the higher education institution in the total number of final and graduation theses defended on a higher education institution (in the past five years).			



3.4. All the necessary information on the online doctoral study programme, as well as the criteria for admission, delivery, progression and completion of the study programme are published in accessible outlets and media.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The higher education institution publishes all the necessary information regarding the online doctoral study programme (admission criteria, the selection of candidates, the delivery of the online doctoral study programme, the terms of the progress and completion of the online doctoral study programme, etc.). The information published by the higher education institution is clear, well-organised, up-to-date, easily searchable and publicly available on the higher education institution's website.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Higher education institution's website;• Outlets in which calls for enrolment of candidates in the online doctoral study programme are published.			



IV. Teaching and supervision capacities and infrastructure

4.1. The higher education institution has ensured an adequate number of teachers and supervisors for the delivery and completion of the study programme.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The higher education institution has an adequate number of teachers employed on scientific-teaching i.e. artistic-teaching positions full time, and an adequate number of teachers appointed in the scientific field in which the programme is being proposed (at least 21 teachers at universities, at least three of which appointed in the scientific field of the programme, and at least seven teachers at faculties or academies of art, at least three of which are appointed in the relevant scientific field).</p> <p>The higher education institution employs teachers who deliver at least 50% of all forms of direct instruction full time on an indefinite term basis.</p> <p>The ratio between the total number of enrolled doctoral candidates and the total number of full-time teachers and those with nominal teaching titles does not exceed 30 : 1 (when calculating the ratio, the number of working hours of teachers who are not employed full time is added up to the number of working hours required of a full-time teacher).</p> <p>The total annual teaching load of all teachers at the public higher education institution does not exceed 20% of the total annual standard teaching load as determined by the Collective Agreement for Science and Higher Education.</p> <p>Total annual teaching load of an individual teacher does not exceed 20% of the total annual standard teaching load.</p> <p>The teaching load on an online study programme includes the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- In the case of the lead instructor and associates on the course: course planning, preparation and creation as well as teaching in the online environment;- Online activities where teacher participation is planned (e.g. teacher-led and teacher-moderated online discussions, lectures delivered via videoconference, synchronous and asynchronous communication with students, etc.);			



- Monitoring student work in the online environment, providing advice on studying and encouraging groups and individuals;
- Other specific needs of particular programme delivery (if there are any);

Teachers and supervisors have adequate qualifications for the delivery of the online doctoral study programme in the scientific area and field in which the programme is proposed.

The status of teachers engaged in online delivery has been regulated and there is a procedure whereby a record is kept of the time they have invested in teaching online.

Teachers/supervisors involved in the delivery of the online doctoral study programme have undergone in-house or external training on teaching online, and/or they have advanced experience with this type of instruction on accredited online study programmes or accredited study programmes delivered in person with an online component.

Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:

- Number of employment contracts of the scientific-teaching staff employed full-time;
- CVs of all teachers/supervisors involved in the delivery of the online doctoral study programme;
- Letter of intent to hire teachers with nominal teaching titles;
- Information on the coverage of teaching delivered by own staff;
- Staff teaching load;
- Doctoral candidate-teacher ratio;
- Ratio of the number of available supervisors and admission quota;
- CROSBİ – CroRIS.



4.2. The higher education institution is distinguished by its research achievements in the scientific discipline in which the doctoral study programme is delivered.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The higher education institution leads projects and organizes scientific conferences that are recognized at the national and international level. Research activities of teachers/supervisors are recognized at the national and international level in the scientific area and field in which the online doctoral study programme is delivered. Teachers and supervisors are involved in national and international research projects, and when possible, involve their doctoral candidates in the projects. Teachers working at the higher education institution participate in national and international reviews of projects, programmes and scientific publications. External associates are recognized experts in their fields, have published adequate research or professional papers and have relevant work experience.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• List of published papers produced by teachers/supervisors;• List of projects of the higher education institution;• List of projects involving teachers/supervisors;• List of projects in which the HEI plans to involve doctoral candidates;• List of scientific conferences, etc. organized by the higher education institution;• List of publications issued by the higher education institution;• Participation of teachers and supervisors in committees and other bodies in the system of higher education and science;• CROSBİ – CroRIS.			



4.3. The online doctoral study programme has mechanisms for assessing the qualifications and for the development of teacher and supervisor competences.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The higher education institution has established mechanisms for assessing and monitoring the qualifications of teachers and supervisors, based on research excellence.</p> <p>The higher education institution is planning to organize workshops or other forms of professional development of teachers and supervisors.</p> <p>The higher education institution has established requirements for appointing supervisors and their obligations, and has a procedure for monitoring supervisors' performance in place.</p> <p>The higher education institution has mechanisms for monitoring the work of supervisors and doctoral candidates in place.</p> <p>The higher education institution has established the procedure for changing a supervisor.</p> <p>The higher education institution is planning to organize workshops or other forms of professional development of supervisors.</p> <p>The higher education institution adopted an open science policy fostering the application of open science principles at the institutional level and ensuring open access to review papers, scientific and professional publications, educational materials and research data of its staff and students.</p> <p>If a higher education institution has established a publishing activity, the publications it issues (books, journals, etc.) are open access publications.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Mechanisms for monitoring teachers' and supervisors' performance in place which are based on research excellence;• The ratio of the number of teachers and the planned number of doctoral candidates;• The ratio of the number of available supervisors and the planned number of doctoral candidates;• HEI's criteria for appointing supervisors;			



agency for science and higher education croatia

- Mechanisms for monitoring supervisors' work with doctoral candidates;
- The share of doctoral dissertations available in open access through the institutional repository;
- The share of open-access scientific and professional publications;
- Share of own open-access publications (books, journals, etc.), as well as the use of open licences and the defined open-access publishing policy;
- Workshops or other forms of professional development for teachers and supervisors planned as part of the study programme.



4.4. The higher education institution has adequate infrastructure for the delivery of the study programme.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The space, equipment and the entire infrastructure are appropriate for the delivery of the online doctoral study programme and ensure achievement of the intended learning outcomes.</p> <p>The space, equipment and the entire infrastructure are appropriate for the research activity of the higher education institution.</p> <p>The space, equipment and the entire infrastructure are appropriate for the delivery of the study programme in an online environment, i.e. with the aid of digital technologies.</p> <p>There is digital access to e-course readings in the e-course, where applicable.</p> <p>Communication between doctoral candidates, and between doctoral candidates and teachers/supervisors is ensured (asynchronous and synchronous) via forum, chat, videoconferencing tools, email or other means.</p> <p>If lectures are included, they have been adapted for the online environment and lectures are followed by opportunities for asynchronous discussion.</p> <p>The library and its equipment and access to relevant databases and/or other content enable the successful performance of research activity.</p> <p>Stability of the computer and communication infrastructure required for online study programme delivery has been ensured.</p> <p>Digital services have been ensured which students and teachers require to carry out planned activities.</p> <p>Privacy and security have been ensured with regard to the use of data on the users of the online learning management system.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Examination of resources of the higher education institution;• Demonstration of online learning platforms;• Institutional repository of review papers - final and graduation theses and doctoral dissertations, publications and open access to research data;			



agency for science and higher education croatia

- Digital literature (e-journals, e-books) available;
- Access to relevant databases;
- Information about the space (ownership documents, document proving the right to use the premises).



4.5. The higher education institution ensures adequate support to teachers/supervisors and students with regard to working in the online environment.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The higher education institution has clearly presented how they provided support to teachers/supervisors in their professional development as it applies to teaching in the online environment prior to applying for the initial accreditation of the online doctoral study programme.</p> <p>The higher education institution has ensured support to teachers/supervisors in their professional development as it applies to teaching in the online environment throughout the delivery of the online study programme.</p> <p>Teacher and /supervisors training for working in the online environment has been carried out.</p> <p>Teacher/supervisor support has been provided with regard to use of available digital technologies required for online delivery.</p> <p>The higher education institution has ensured support to teachers/supervisors in using digital services to be used on the doctoral study programme.</p> <p>Teachers are provided with assistance regarding the development of open educational resources (OER) required for teaching, as well as regarding the use of teaching materials developed by other teachers and available through open access and/or networking via massive open online courses (MOOCs), with appropriate respect for intellectual property.</p> <p>The higher education institution encourages teachers/supervisors to take part in conferences on online learning.</p> <p>There is/are (a) person(s) in charge of the following, in addition to the competent vice-dean/vice-rector:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- online teaching design and delivery in accordance with the institutional strategy;- preparation of procurement plans and infrastructure improvement plans for the purposes of online teaching delivery, where applicable;- needs analysis and continuous professional development of teachers with regard to the use of digital technologies and their appropriate use in the educational process;- defining methods of student assessment and reporting on student achievements in online classes. <p>There is/are (a) person(s) in charge of student exchange agreements for online study programmes delivered with other higher education institutions (virtual</p>			



student mobility, joint studies and courses, European university alliances, etc.).

There is a service which will carry out the daily monitoring of the entire system and be equipped for troubleshooting within a 24-hour period, should this be unavoidable and feasible. There are the following dedicated persons at the institution for online communication with students:

- person/service responding to queries related to the online study programme (student office): admissions, attendance, collecting grades, various certificates, etc.;
- person/service responding to any technical queries related to attending classes, e.g. students are having trouble navigating the system, cannot follow online lectures, cannot log on to the system, are experiencing technical issues when accessing learning materials for class or exams (e.g. Safe Exam Browser is not working, the webcam cannot be turned on, there are issues accessing the videoconferencing software, etc.);

The student is responsible for the security and stability of the computer and communication infrastructure at the remote location where the exam is taken. Digital services have been ensured which students and teachers require to carry out planned activities (e.g. institutional email account, online library access, user account for LMS, wiki or other environments, AAI@EduHr electronic identity required to access a broader range of digital services offered within the educational system, etc.).

The final theses of students on the online doctoral study programme must be publicly available and stored in the same manner and for the same period of time as the final theses of students attending doctoral study programmes delivered in-person (in the institutional repository).

Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:

- Examples of teacher training and other forms of teacher support regarding work in the online environment;
- Office/team/person responsible for teacher support regarding development of teaching materials (multimedia);
- Examples of institutional recommendations/guidelines regarding the visual appearance and compulsory elements of online course content, where applicable;
- Established system of incentivizing/rewarding teachers/supervisors;
- Number of conferences attended and number of scientific and professional papers on the topic of online learning.



4.6. The higher education institution has sufficient funds to deliver the online doctoral study programme, which are distributed transparently and in a manner that improves doctoral education.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The higher education institution has access to financial resources necessary to deliver the study programme.</p> <p>The public higher education institution has sufficient funds to deliver the study programme in the form of a concluded programme agreement or projections of income from tuition fees or other sources.</p> <p>Funds collected for the purposes of doctoral education are distributed transparently and in a manner that improves doctoral education (they ensure the delivery of the study programme and support to the candidates' research so they could successfully complete doctoral studies).</p> <p>The higher education institution invests in the acquisition of new and updated print and/or digital reading, in enabling access to bibliographic databases and in upgrading software and digital tools at its disposal to meet the needs of modern doctoral education and scientific work.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Programme agreement;• Three-year plan of income and expenditures of the higher education institution;• Ordinance on the allocation of funds.			



4.7. Tuition fees are determined on the basis of transparent criteria and actual study costs, and admission quotas are determined taking into account the funding available to the doctoral candidates, that is, on the basis of the absorption potentials of research projects or other sources of funding.	Not fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Fulfilled
<p><u>Elements and indicators of the standard</u></p> <p>The higher education institution has determined the tuition fee on the basis of transparent criteria and actual cost of study. The higher education institution has established quotas taking into account the funding available to the doctoral candidates, that is, on the basis of the absorption potentials of research projects or other sources of funding.</p> <p><u>Sources for verifying compliance with the standard:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Calculation of the estimated cost of the proposed online doctoral study programme per doctoral candidate;• Three-year plan of income and expenditures of the higher education institution;• Analysis based on which admission quota is determined;• Mechanisms for involving doctoral candidates in research projects;• List of research projects in which doctoral candidates can/plan to be involved.			



agency for science and higher education croatia

Article 3

These Quality Standards shall be published on the website of the Agency and shall enter into force on the eighth day of their publication on the website.



President of the Accreditation Council

Prof. Mirjana Hruškar, PhD

The Quality Standards are published on the Agency website on 18.6. 2024 and shall come into force on 26.6. 2024.